



Meeting Minutes

PRCC Hatchery Subcommittee

Thursday, October 16, 2008
10:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m.
Douglas PUD Auditorium
Wenatchee, WA

PRCC Hatchery Subcommittee Members

Kris Petersen, NMFS	David Carie, USFWS
Jerry Marco, CCT	Russ Langshaw, GCPUD
Tom Scribner, Keely Murdoch, YN	Carl Merkle, CTUIR
Kirk Truscott, WDFW	

ATTENDEES: (*Denotes PRCC Hatchery Subcommittee Member)

Kris Petersen, NMFS*	David Carie/Bill Gale, USFWS*
Tom Scribner/Keely Murdoch, YN*	Bob Pfeifer/Jeff Korth, WDFW
Kirk Truscott, WDFW*	Julie Pyper/Joe Miller, Chelan PUD
Russell Langshaw, GCPUD*	Todd Pearsons, Grant PUD
Curt Dotson, Grant PUD	Alyssa Buck, GCPUD
Debbie Williams, GCPUD	Denny Rohr, Facilitator

Action Items:

- 1. Action Item #8 from the September 18, 2008 PRCC HSC meeting. Petersen and Langshaw will discuss NOAA's confirmation letter regarding short-term acclimation sites.**
- 2. Truscott and Murdoch will provide Pearsons with data information used by the JFP to determine their summer Chinook position.**
- 3. Pearsons will draft a list of proposed segregated summer Chinook sites.**
- 4. Grant PUD will provide an update to the PRCC regarding summer Chinook acclimation sites in the lower Wenatchee Basin.**
- 5. WDFW, USFWS, and the Yakama Nation will provide Quantitative Objective comments to Pearsons by 11/07/08.**

6. Williams will send Priest Rapids Hatchery Design meeting minutes in the Jacobs format to Rohr for distribution to Truscott.
7. Murdoch will verify if scale samples were taken for the precocial parr trapped in the White River rotary screw-trap.
8. Scribner requested that photographs of fish remaining on station at AquaSeed be provided to the PRCC HSC.
9. Langshaw will distribute the LWSNFH monthly broodstock report to the PRCC HSC.
10. Langshaw will talk to Susan Gutenberger, USFWS regarding BY06 fish health.
11. Grant PUD will rewrite language of SOA 2008-1, Grant PUD's Sockeye Salmon Mitigation Requirement and redistribute to the PRCC HSC. The subsequent vote to approve or deny the SOA will be conducted via email.

Final Meeting Minutes

- I. **Welcome and Introductions** – Attendees introduced themselves around the table.
- II. **Agenda Review** – No additions were made to the agenda.
- III. **Approval of Meeting Minutes** –
 - September 18, 2008 – Minutes will be acted upon at the next meeting.
- IV. **Action Items Review** – Action items were reviewed. Regarding distribution of the WDFW-Yakama Nation white paper, WDFW feels it is appropriate from the technical aspect as well as the policy aspect to speak with the Yakama Nation before distribution to the PRCC HSC. Also, **Action Item #8 from the September 18, 2008 PRCC HSC meeting will remain.**
- V. **Review and Discussion**
 - A **JFP Meeting** – JFP members met prior to the PRCC HSC meeting to discuss issues related to HGMP development.
 - B **T. Pearsons document – Quantitative Objectives/Aug. 26, 2008** – Pearsons distributed a HGMP status completion update to the HSC. On August 26, 2008, Pearsons distributed Quantitative Objectives for Grant PUD funded hatchery programs. The conclusion of the document specifically stated that in order to meet NMFS and FERC timelines, Grant PUD must receive quantitative objectives from the JFP by October 01, 2008 so that HGMPs and monitoring and evaluation plans can be completed. If objectives were not received prior to October 01, 2008, Grant PUD would assume the objectives contained in the document represent the JFP objectives and will be included in the HGMP submitted to NMFS. The Quantitative Objectives document had not been reviewed by all members of the JFP and they were not prepared to accept them as final. Truscott stated that he understood the need to complete the

quantitative objectives for HGMP development and that the administrative record will show that Grant PUD has been trying to get an agreement on what is needed to develop HGMPs for a long time. However, the Districts approach for consensus (no JFP response to the draft objectives infers agreement) was unacceptable given the importance of the objectives. Further, Truscott suggested that a more appropriate approach for attaining a decision on the objectives is to develop an SOA for the Quantitative Objectives, as this would prompt a Committee discussion and vote consistent with other important decisions made by the Committee. After discussion, HSC members agreed that an SOA is appropriate. Grant PUD will continue to develop HGMPs utilizing quantitative objectives defined by Pearsons until the JFP provides other objectives. Petersen explained that if Grant PUD submits HGMPs to NMFS without consensus of the PRCC HSC, the agencies and tribes would still have the opportunity to comment.

- C **T. Pearsons document – HGMP List of Questions/Aug. 26, 2008** – See discussion below under Summer Chinook Conservation & GCPUD Production.
- D **NMFS Hatchery Consultation Process** – Langshaw stated that Grant PUD will work to meet NOAA hatchery consultation timelines while working towards HGMP deadlines in the License Order. Because Grant PUD must coordinate HGMP's with other entities in the basin, Langshaw noted Grant PUD's concern of meeting imposed timelines. Petersen stated that if it is helpful for her to meet with Grant PUD regarding HGMP development, she can do so the day before or after regular scheduled PRCC HSC meeting dates.
- E **Summer Chinook Conservation & GCPUD Production** – At the August 19, 2008 PRCC HSC meeting, members were asked if artificial propagation was needed for conservation of summer Chinook. Grant PUD was directed to develop a list of questions pertaining to the HGMPs. JFP members were asked to discuss the list of questions at their upcoming September 03, 2008 meeting. No response was received from the JFP regarding the need for artificial propagation to conserve summer Chinook. Grant PUD drafted a white paper regarding the Artificial Propagation Needs for Conservation of Upper Columbia Summer Chinook Salmon and distributed it to the PRCC HSC on October 03, 2008. Comments were asked for by October 17, 2008.

As of today's meeting, no comments have been received by Grant PUD. Today's discussion centered on integrated vs. segregated programs, the 1/3 split of summer Chinook artificial propagation (833,000 smolts) between the Wenatchee, Methow, and Okanogan, use of the AHA model to determine which programs are most beneficial to an area, scientific and management processes, PNI thresholds, HSRG recommendations, over wintering, and program locations.

JFP members stated it's their desire for 1/3 of the production to be dedicated to the Wenatchee with a well integrated program somewhere in

the lower watershed with over wintering facilities. The JFP would like to increase the success of the Chelan PUD program by updating the facility to an over wintering site, or have Grant PUD build an over wintering facility at Dryden. **Truscott and Murdoch will provide Pearsons with data information used by the JFP to determine the JFP's summer Chinook position.** Truscott and Pearsons also agreed to discuss, off-line, the District's evaluation of the Wenatchee summer Chinook provided by Pearsons. Scribner stated the Yakama Nation wouldn't approve of Chelan Falls for terminal fisheries for the tribe, and that Dryden would provide a more traditional blockage preferred by the Yakama tribe. Dotson explained that over wintering at the Dryden site doesn't look good because the water system is operated by the irrigation system, and water is hard to come by in the winter. Dotson questioned if Crab Creek could be utilized, as Grant PUD and WDFW both own land there, and it has a ready water supply. Truscott stated WDFW would be cautious regarding use of Crab Creek because they want in kind, in place mitigation as a means to mitigate the Priest Rapids Project effects to the Wenatchee River summer Chinook population. Langshaw stated the Settlement Agreement does not have any stipulations for objectives or where mitigation should occur. He explained that if the objective is to provide harvest opportunity, Crab Creek offers that.

Truscott recommended that the HSC work collaboratively with the Quantitative Objectives document and Grant PUD to reach a final decision. Pearsons explained that based on the data; there is enough science to prove that a segregated program would provide less risk to the Wenatchee summer Chinook population than an integrated program. **Pearsons will draft a list of proposed segregated summer Chinook sites.** Scribner stated he doesn't believe the Yakama Nation will ever agree with a segregated program because of harvest issues, not science issues. The Yakama's require a place to use more traditional forms of harvest, not hook and line, stated Scribner. Members discussed elevating summer Chinook issue's to the PRCC if they could not reach agreement by the next meeting. Petersen stated that because the summer Chinook HGMP is also serving as the ESA consultation for a new program, it must contain greater detail than existing program HGMPs. Petersen noted that the JFP did provide guidance as to what they expect for summer Chinook acclimation in the lower Wenatchee Basin, and would like to have Grant PUD update the HSC on properties listed for sale, possible program locations, and water availability. **Grant PUD will provide an update to the PRCC regarding summer Chinook acclimation sites in the lower Wenatchee Basin. WDFW, USFWS, and the Yakama Nation will provide Quantitative Objective comments to Pearsons by 11/07/08.** Petersen stated that NOAA will most likely support the other co-managers decisions regarding Quantitative Objectives. Petersen suggested, and members agreed that Grant PUD should use Table 2 of the Quantitative Objectives as a starting point for the summer Chinook HGMP.

VI. Fall Chinook

- A **Priest Rapids Hatchery design – Williams will send Priest Rapids Hatchery Design meeting minutes in the Jacobs format to Rohr for distribution to Truscott.** Reverse load factoring began yesterday, October 15, 2008 and will remain the default operating procedure during the Hanford Reach spawning period. Maintenance is currently being conducted on Vernita Bar to provide good flow delineation intervals. WDFW will take 1.7 million eggs for the Corps program. Grant PUD will expect to be reimbursed by WDFW for costs incurred by the Corps program. Langshaw explained that the hatchery will be relocated to channel section 10.
- B **HGMP** – Upon completion of the M & E plan, the draft Priest Rapids Hatchery HGMP will be complete.
- C **M & E** – The Priest Rapids Hatchery M & E sub-committee met on September 29, 2008 and made significant progress towards agreement on many of the objectives and approaches to address them. Grant PUD will continue development of the M & E Plan.
- D **Fall Chinook Work Group** – A draft study plan to evaluate operational impacts to fall Chinook in the Hanford Reach will be sent out for a 60 day comment period on October 17, 2008.

VII. Summer Chinook

- A **HGMP** – See discussion above under Summer Chinook Conservation & GCPUD Production.

VIII. Spring Chinook

- A **Spring Chinook management in Wenatchee Basin white paper (Yakama Nation-WDFW)** – Korth, WDFW stated that within a month WDFW and the Yakama Nation hope to have issues resolved surrounding the draft white paper. Upon completion, the white paper will be distributed first to the JFP, and then to Grant PUD. Pearsons questioned how Grant PUD is expected to meet NOAA's final HGMP consultation deadline of February 01, 2009 without knowing what the JFP will require in a HGMP. Petersen suggested that Grant PUD write a HGMP that is consistent with the Salmon Steelhead Settlement Agreement (SSA) and the 2008 Biological Opinion. In addition, Petersen suggests Table 2 of Pearsons Quantitative Objects be used to develop HGMP's.
- B **White River** – A well developed on the McComas property is producing 60 GPM. It will be determined at a later date if an additional well is needed for de-icing purposes.
 - **HGMP** – See discussion above under T. Pearsons document – Quantitative Objectives/Aug. 26, 2008.

- **Wenatchee Water Quality** – Total Maximum Daily Load (TMDL), is a calculation of the maximum amount of a pollutant that a waterbody can receive and still safely meet water quality standards. TMDL has been an ongoing issue in the Wenatchee River. Grant PUD will be providing comments to the Wenatchee River TMDL prior to the end of the comment period on November 30, 2008. Langshaw explained that a water quality implementation plan needs to be developed for the White River. After discussions with Washington Department of Ecology (WDOE), Grant PUD will have to complete a tier 2 analysis, and will need to meet load allocations for the mainstem Wenatchee. Langshaw doesn't expect the White River spring Chinook program will have any problems meeting the TMDL because of the limited production size, but because of TMDL allocation concerns on the mainstem, permitting a summer Chinook production there does cause concern.
- **Rotary screw trap** – Summaries were sent electronically to members. Murdoch explained that several bull trout have been captured this year, and that it is the second year that precocial parr have been trapped during spawning in the White River. But, they haven't been found in the Nason Creek trap. **Murdoch will verify if scale samples were taken for the precocial parr trapped in the White River rotary screw-trap.** Grant PUD is working with the Yakama Nation to repair and update the 8' trap for use in the White River.
- **Short-term acclimation** – Langshaw explained that Grant PUD needs letters from NMFS and USFWS confirming that short-term acclimation activities are consistent with existing permits. The U.S. Corp needs them to complete their ESA review as part of the JARPA process. Grant PUD will need to resubmit a new permit application if the letters are not received by 10/31/08. Nets are the only equipment yet to arrive. Grant PUD hopes to do feasibility installations this fall at the McComas and RM11 site.
- **Fish Transfer to Little White Salmon National Fish Hatchery (LWSNFH)** – To date, there have been no BY07 mortalities related to the pilot transfer. Langshaw explained that Kerwin, WDFW is anticipating a transfer permit for the BY06 pilot transfer and remaining BY07's that will occur on Oct. 20, 2008. No fish health analysis has been completed for fish remaining on station at AquaSeed, but some fin degradation can be seen. Petersen stated that should be documented prior to transfer, incase of a mortality event and that the committee should be made aware of all observations prior to any transfer. Members discussed transporting less fish per trip, while making more trips to minimize the total 5% allowable mortality. Langshaw explained that BY06 has 96 fish, and that 5 mortalities equal

5%. Members feel they have done everything possible to minimize mortalities. **Scribner requested that photographs of fish remaining on station at AquaSeed be provided to the PRCC HSC.** Truscott stated that the Section 10 permit allows 5% mortality of broodstock, and that Grant PUD, the Yakama Nation and WDFW are all co-permit holders. Members questioned if the Section 10 permit states mortality is 5% of the entire amount of fish transferred, or 5% of each transfer? Members agreed, the older the broodyear, the greater the risk of transfer. Average BY06 AquaSeed mortality is 1% monthly. Langshaw explained that he just received word that the transfer permit was issued today, October 16, 2008, and that he will notify AquaSeed to take the fish off feed prior to the October 20, 2008 transfer date. **Langshaw will distribute the LWSNFH monthly broodstock report to the PRCC HSC. Langshaw will talk to Susan Gutenberger, USFWS regarding BY06 fish health.**

C **Nason Creek –**

- **HGMP** – See discussion above under T. Pearsons document – Quantitative Objectives/Aug. 26, 2008.
- **Rotary screw trap** – Summaries were sent electronically to members.

IX. **Sockeye –**

A **SOA** – Members requested that the agenda reflect when an SOA vote will be asked for. SOA 2008-1, Experimental Reintroduction of Sockeye Salmon into Skaha Lake was distributed to the committee. Petersen stated the Salmon and Steelhead Settlement Agreement (SSA) didn't define requirements for this program, but it is her understanding that Grant PUD will complete an HGMP for this program. She voiced some uncertainty as to ESA requirements of the program, and questioned if the program meets Grant PUD's obligation for artificial propagation of 1.1 million sockeye. Members asked that Grant PUD rewrite some of the language in the SOA. Petersen would like the statement that this program meets "all" of the requirements of Grant PUD's artificial propagation and monitoring and evaluation requirements changed. Truscott suggests the SOA include investigating improving hatchery operations before determining the reintroduction isn't feasible. Langshaw explained that ONA is using adaptive management and if there are opportunities to improve hatchery operations, it will be done, possibly before the study is complete. Pyper noted that Chelan PUD looks forward to working with Grant PUD on this program. **Grant PUD will rewrite language of SOA 2008-1 and redistribute to the PRCC HSC. The subsequent vote to approve or deny the SOA will be conducted via email.**

B **HGMP** – See discussion above under T. Pearsons document – Quantitative Objectives/Aug. 26, 2008.

Next Meeting: Thursday, November 20, 2008, Wenatchee, WA, TBD.