



Meeting Minutes

PRCC Hatchery Subcommittee

Tuesday, September 23, 2008
 Conference Call

PRCC Hatchery Subcommittee Members

Kris Petersen, NMFS	David Carie, USFWS
Jerry Marco, CCT	Russ Langshaw, GCPUD
Tom Scribner, Keely Murdoch, YN	Carl Merkle, CTUIR
Kirk Truscott, WDFW	

ATTENDEES: (*Denotes PRCC Hatchery Subcommittee Member)

Kris Petersen, NMFS*	Jerry Marco, CCT*
Tom Scribner, YN*	Tom Dresser, GCPUD
Kirk Truscott, WDFW*	Russell Langshaw, GCPUD*
John Kerwin, WDFW	Debbie Williams, GCPUD
Denny Rohr, Facilitator	

Action Items:

1. Langshaw will send White River captive broodstock female egg numbers to PRCC HSC.

Decision Summary:

- PRCC Hatchery Sub-committee members agree (NMFS abstained from the decision) to the transfer of all White River spring Chinook broodstock to the Little White Salmon National Fish Hatchery.
- PRCC HSC members agree (NMFS abstained from the decision) that fish will be PIT-tagged four weeks after the transfer.

Final Meeting Minutes

Petersen updated the PRCC Hatchery Sub-committee as to her debriefing with Bob Lohn and Rob Jones after the conference call with AquaSeed on September 22, 2008. She explained that they discussed the background information of the first transfer, when the

decision was made to stop the transfer because of mortality, they reviewed smolt production estimates based on conversations with Mike Tonseth, and cumulative causes of mortalities based on all reports received. She stated that Lohn expressed concern about moving forward with the transfer. His perception was that AquaSeed said it was risky and we would kill fish, and we did. Lohn questions if Grant PUD and WDFW can be trusted to transport fish safely. Truscott stated that WDFW didn't transfer the fish the first time, and they won't be this time, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) did. Petersen agreed to clarify who moved the fish in her summarization to Lohn and Walton. Petersen noted that the transfer could proceed before her memo is drafted. Petersen stated it is NOAA's responsibility to regulate the safety of the fish. They didn't recommend the transfer, but they did approve it. Petersen explained that NOAA has concerns of their appearance of culpability in the mortalities associated with the transfer. Petersen explained that NOAA wants to make it clear that they may allow more transfers, but NOAA is not the permit holder, Grant PUD is and it is their responsibility to assure the safety of the fish. Petersen was tasked by Lohn to write a memo to himself and Walton summarizing what WDFW has proposed in their pilot transfer protocol. NOAA is willing to move forward with 15% of the BY07 pilot transfer. Petersen stated that if it can be done successfully, NOAA is willing to allow the transfers to proceed. But, if mortalities occur, the transfers will stop. NOAA is comfortable having some fish remain at AquaSeed while others are at the Little White Salmon National Fish Hatchery (LWSNFH). Petersen stated that Grant PUD needs to demonstrate that the fish can be moved safely without any mortality above the 5% allowed in the permit, and that Grant PUD will be held responsible for the health of the fish. Langshaw stated his comfort with this. Scribner stated that the Yakama Nation (YN) would support Grant PUD in the decision to transfer fish, and that they wouldn't leave Grant PUD solely responsible if another mortality event were to happen.

Petersen stated that NOAA will abstain from any vote today regarding the transfer and PIT-tagging of fish prior to a move. Dresser stated that Grant PUD has a program that is based on approval by NOAA, and there are certain parties listed that Grant PUD must consult with. Dresser strongly suggested elevating this issue to Tim Culbertson, Grant PUD Manager, and Bob Lohn. Dresser questioned the existence of the PRCC HSC when their scientific decisions aren't honored. Petersen stated that abstaining doesn't prevent consensus within the committee. NOAA isn't directing or guaranteeing success of the transfer. Petersen leaves the call.

Truscott stated WDFW is trying to figure out the risk to the program related to when the 07 BY are PIT tagged. Members discussed PIT-tagging and sampling of BY07, and the elevated risk of doing it before the move. If mortality is high, it might not be possible to make program. Langshaw suggested that genetics could be done when the fish are spawning if necessary. He noted his concern that PIT-tagging has caused huge mortality events at AquaSeed before and tagging prior to transfer could lead to another mortality event. Langshaw stated that previous mortalities have been attributed to the quality and size of fish at AquaSeed. Langshaw expressed his concern that if the mortality events are associated with size and tagging leads to a mortality event prior to the pilot transfer, he guarantees that no fish will be moved and they will remain at AquaSeed until they die from disease or spawning. Scribner want's to minimize the risk of the fish, but want's to transfer the fish. Scribner believes the fish will be healthier at LWSNFS. Truscott stated WDFW

will abstain from the PIT-tagging issue, but that WDFW agrees that the transfer should proceed. WDFW recommends that WDFW fish health staff approve of the transfer before it starts. Kerwin states he will be out of the office until Thursday, September 25, 2008 and will speak to his boss regarding the transfer permit then. **PRCC HSC members agreed** (NMFS abstained from the decision) **that the fish will be PIT-tagged four weeks after the transfer.**

Susan Gutenberger, USFWS will contact Larry Durham, WDFW regarding the health of the fish prior to the transfer. Langshaw will contact USFWS so they can begin preparing for the transfer.